Arizona’s Public Records: Statutes and Practices

SESSION 2 OF 6 ON RECORDS MANAGEMENT

This training does not constitute a legal opinion or legal advice on the part of the Library, Archives and Public Records Branch, of the Secretary of State.
Presenter(s)

Richard Carroll  
*Records Analyst*  
RM Training; Retention Schedules and Imaging – Counties, Higher Education (ASU, NAU, UA), Community Colleges and K-12  
Archives and Records Management Branch  
Arizona Secretary of State

And/or  
Elizabeth Adigwu  
*Records Analyst*  
RM Training; Retention Schedules and Imaging – All Municipalities, Fire Districts and Special Districts  
Archives and Records Management Branch  
Arizona Secretary of State

And/or  
Kurtis Chandler  
*Records Analyst*  
RM Training; Records Retention Schedules and Imaging – All State Agencies, Boards and Commissions  
Archives and Records Management Branch  
Arizona Secretary of State
Session Guidelines and General Information

Preserving Arizona

Arizona State Library, Archives and Public Records
ARM Website

Guidance And FAQs

Retention Schedules
Schedules are for all “Public Bodies” in the State of Arizona. These include General Schedules and Custom Schedules.

Archives And Records Management Forms And Approvals
PDFs of transfer forms, disposition and destruction forms, and imaging and microfilming forms.

Guidance, Standards And Statutes
Guidance on: permanent and historical records; Arizona Revised Statutes applying to Archives and Records Management; storage and handling of material; minimum standards for digital imaging; scanning of photographs; “Born Digital” photographs; Arizona standards for permanent records; a certificate of compliance for microfilm; as well as our Records Officer Handbook.

FAQs-General Records Management
Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) for general Records Management.

FAQs-Fire Districts
Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) for Fire Districts.

FAQs-HR/Personnel
Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) from the Human Relations/Personnel Retention Schedule.

FAQs-School Districts And Charter Schools
Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) for School Districts and Charter Schools.
General Ground Rules for On-Line Sessions

1. Please remember that while you are in the on-line classroom, all other participants can hear everything you say (even in the background), and can see everything you write on the whiteboard.

2. I will be muting All participants to help with sound distortion.

3. Please make sure that all phones are muted during the sessions.

4. Feel free to submit notes during session for discussion. If you would like to send a note / comment, please send to “all” so that everyone can see the question and then hear the answer to that question.

5. Please raise your hand if you wish to speak

6. Take a vote: How many of you are participating in today’s session with a group of co-workers?

7. If so, how many of you are there in your group? (Send # as a note)

8. At the end of the training, I will be taking questions. Write down any questions you have during the session, and we will have an opportunity to ask them at the end.
Records Management Statutes
from
Arizona Revised Statutes

SESSION 2 OF 6 ON RECORDS MANAGEMENT
What Is a “Record”

ARS 41-151.18 Definition of Records

In this article, unless the context otherwise requires:

- “Records" means all books, papers, maps, photographs or other documentary materials

- Regardless of physical form or characteristics, including prints or copies of such items produced or reproduced on film or electronic media pursuant to section 41-151.16

- Made or received by any governmental agency in pursuance of law or in connection with the transaction of public business and preserved or appropriate for preservation by the agency or its legitimate successor

- As evidence of the organization, functions, policies, decisions, procedures, operations or other activities of the government, or because of the informational and historical value of data contained in the record, and includes records that are made confidential by statute
What is *Not* a Record

ARS 41-151.18  Definition of records – *continued*

Not included within the definition of records as used in this article:

- Library or Museum material made or acquired solely for reference or exhibition purposes
- Extra copies of documents preserved only for convenience of reference
- Stocks of publications or documents intended for sale or distribution to interested persons
## Title 39 - Arizona’s Public Records Law – Summary

### Chapter 1  PUBLIC RECORDS

- **39-121**  Inspection of public records
- **39-121.01**  Definitions; maintenance of records; copies, printouts or photographs of public records; examination by mail; index
- **39-121.02**  Action on denial of access; costs and attorney fees; damages
- **39-121.03**  Request for copies, printouts or photographs; statement of purpose; commercial purpose as abuse of public record; determination by governor; civil penalty; definition
- **39-122**  Free searches for and copies of public records to be used in claims against United States; liability for noncompliance
- **39-123**  Information identifying eligible persons; confidentiality; definitions
- **39-124**  Releasing information identifying an eligible person; violations; classification; definitions
- **39-125**  Information relating to location of archaeological discoveries and places or objects included or eligible for inclusion on the Arizona register of historic places; confidentiality
- **39-126**  Federal risk assessments of infrastructure; confidentiality
- **39-127**  Free copies of police reports and transcripts for crime victims; definitions
- **39-128**  Disciplinary records of public officers and employees; disclosure; exceptions
ARS 39-121  Inspection of public records

Public records and other matters in the custody of any officer shall be open to inspection...

- By any person.
- At all times during office hours.
Basic Definitions

ARS 39-121.01 Definitions; maintenance of records; copies, printouts or photographs of public records; examination by mail; index

In this article, unless the context otherwise otherwise requires:

- “Officer” means any person **elected** or **appointed** to hold any elective or appointive office of any public body and any **chief administrative officer, head, director, superintendent** or **chairman** of any public body.

- “Public body” means this state, any **county, city, town, school district, political subdivision** or **tax-supported district** in this state, any **branch, department, board, bureau, commission, council or committee** of the foregoing, and any **public organization** or **agency**, supported in whole or in part by monies from this state or any political subdivision of this state, or expending monies provided by this state or any political subdivision of this state.
Maintaining and Preserving Records

ARS 39-121.01  Definitions; maintenance of records; copies, printouts or photographs of public records; examination by mail; index

- All officers and public bodies shall maintain all records reasonably necessary or appropriate to:
  - Maintain an accurate knowledge of their official activities and of any of their activities which are supported by monies from this state or any political subdivision of this state.

- Each public body shall be responsible for the preservation, maintenance and care of that body's public records.
  - It shall be the duty of each such body to carefully secure, protect and preserve public records from deterioration, mutilation, loss or destruction...
Any person may request to examine or be furnished copies, printouts or photographs of any public record...

- during regular office hours or
- may request that the custodian mail a copy of any public record not otherwise available on the public body's website to the requesting person.

The custodian may require any person requesting to pay in advance for any copying and postage charges.

The custodian of such records shall promptly furnish such copies, printouts or photographs...
1. May the public body charge a copying fee if the Requestor has not asked for one BUT the public body needs to make one to allow for inspection?

A: NO

A member of the public is entitled to inspect public records at all times during business hours. If, for Whatever reason the public body needs to make a copy to provide the record to the Requestor for inspection, charging for the copy is not appropriate.

May charge for copying and postage But Not for inspection.

Examples: Keeping records electronically may require a copy for the Requestor to inspect the records. Records may require redaction, and a copy may need to be made so Requestor can view redacted records.
2. May the public body charge a copying fee when the Requestor copies public records using a personal device (such as smartphone, tablet, portable scanner) providing the copying is not disruptive to public business?

A: A public body may charge copying fees only if it makes the copies itself using public resources and furnishes them to the Requestor.

If the Requestor makes copies using their own personal device, the Statutes do not allow the public body to charge a fee.

**May charge for making copies and postage**
**No copies made = no charges**
The specific question asked, and this opinion, assume the Requestor’s use of a personal device:

1. Is not **disruptive to public business** (record custodian’s determination)

2. Is not going to **destroy, damage or alter** the public documents.

Example: documents are fragile and personal device use could damage the fragile records in the process of copying them.

Location of AG Opinion #I13-012:

What information does the public have to provide for a public records request?

Can a public body require the public use a specific form to make a public records request?

- Arizona law does not require that the requestor make a written request.

*From the AZ Ombudsman’s Office, Public Records Law publication (page 36):*

A public records requestor is obligated to:

- **Provide a description of the item** requested.
- **State whether it will be used for a commercial or noncommercial purpose.**
  A public body may ask the requestor for additional information (e.g. name, phone number, email address, home address, or reason for the request).
- **If the requestor refuses** to provide this information however, it cannot be used as grounds to deny the request.
- If the requestor refuses to make a written request and insists on making a verbal request, the **absences of a written request** cannot be the basis for denial.
ARS 39-121.01 Definitions; maintenance of records; copies, printouts or photographs of public records; examination by mail; index

This includes *ONLY* State Agencies (excepting the Governor, DPS, MVD (ADOT), Department of Corrections, Dept. of Juvenile Corrections). BUT, it includes any joint entity created by a Local Agency and a State Agency.

- **If requested**, the custodian of the records of an agency shall also *furnish an index of records or categories of records that have been withheld*

- **and the reasons the records or categories of records have been withheld** from the requesting person.

- The custodian shall **not include in the index** information that is *expressly made privileged or confidential in statute or a court order.*

- **E. Access** to a public record is **deemed denied** if a custodian fails to promptly respond to a request for production of a public record or fails to provide to the requesting person an index of any record or categories of records that are withheld from production...
Custodian of Record Needs to Retain Custody of the Record

ARS 39-121.01  Definitions; maintenance of records; copies, printouts or photographs of public records; examination by mail; index

The copies, printouts or photographs shall be made while the public record is in the possession, custody and control of the custodian of the public record and shall be subject to the supervision of such custodian.
ARS 39-121.02  Action on denial of access; costs and attorney fees; damages

- Any person who has requested to examine or copy public records and who has been denied access to or the right to copy such records -
  - May appeal the denial through a special action in the superior court.

- The court may award attorney fees and other legal costs that are reasonably incurred in any action if the person seeking public records has substantially prevailed.

- Nothing in this subsection shall limit the rights of any party to recover attorney fees, expenses and double damages.
When a person requests copies, printouts or photographs of public records for a commercial purpose, the person shall provide a statement setting forth the commercial purpose for which the copies, printouts or photographs will be used.

Commercial Purpose: expectation of making money off of the information

- For the purposes of this section, "commercial purpose" means the use of a public record for the purpose of sale or resale or for the purpose of producing a document containing all or part of the copy, printout or photograph for sale or the obtaining of names and addresses from public records for the purpose of solicitation or the sale of names and addresses to another for the purpose of solicitation or for any purpose in which the purchaser can reasonably anticipate the receipt of monetary gain from the direct or indirect use of the public record.
- Commercial purpose does not mean the use of a public record as evidence or as research for evidence in an action in any judicial or quasi-judicial body.
ARS 39-121.03 Request for copies, printouts or photographs; statement of purpose; commercial purpose as abuse of public record; determination by governor; civil penalty; definition

- Upon being furnished the statement the custodian of such records may furnish reproductions, the charge for which shall include the following:

  1. A portion of the cost to the public body for obtaining the original or copies of the documents, printouts or photographs.
  
  2. A reasonable fee for the cost of time, materials, equipment and personnel in producing such reproduction.
  
  3. The value of the reproduction on the commercial market as best determined by the public body.

- If the custodian of a public record determines that the commercial purpose stated in the statement is a misuse of public records or is an abuse of the right to receive public records, the custodian may apply to the governor requesting that the governor by executive order prohibit the furnishing of copies, printouts or photographs for such commercial purpose...
ARS 39-121.03 Request for copies, printouts or photographs; statement of purpose; commercial purpose as abuse of public record; determination by governor; civil penalty; definition

- A person who obtains a public record for a commercial purpose **without indicating the commercial purpose** or
- Who obtains a public record for a noncommercial purpose and **uses or knowingly allows the use of such public record for a commercial purpose** or
- **Uses or knowingly allows the use of such public record for a different commercial purpose** or
- Who obtains a public record **from anyone other than the custodian** of such records and **uses it for a commercial purpose** shall
- In addition to other penalties be liable to the state or the political subdivision from which the public record was obtained **for damages in the amount of three times the amount which would have been charged for the public record had the commercial purpose been stated** plus costs and reasonable attorney fees or
- Shall be liable to the state or the political subdivision **for the amount of three times the actual damages** if it can be shown that the public record would not have been provided had the commercial purpose of actual use been stated at the time of obtaining the records.

What’s the harm in lying?
ARS 39-122 Free searches for and copies of public records to be used in claims against United States; liability for noncompliance

- No state, county or city, or any officer or board thereof shall demand or receive a fee or compensation,

- when they are to be used in connection with a claim for a pension, allotment, allowance, compensation, insurance or other benefits which is to be presented to the United States or a bureau or department thereof,

- on request of an official of the United States, a claimant, his guardian or attorney.
Protected Information for ‘Eligible Persons’

ARS 39-123 Information identifying eligible persons; confidentiality; definitions

A. Nothing in this chapter requires disclosure from a personnel file by a law enforcement agency or employing state or local governmental entity of the home address or home telephone number of eligible persons.

B. The agency or governmental entity may release the information in subsection A of this section only if either:

1. The person consents in writing to the release.

2. The custodian of records of the agency or governmental entity determines that release of the information does not create a reasonable risk of physical injury to the person or the person's immediate family or damage to the property of the person or the person's immediate family.
## List of ‘Eligible Persons’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eligible person</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a former public official</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>peace officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>spouse of a peace officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>spouse or minor child of a deceased peace officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>border patrol agent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>justice, judge, commissioner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public defender</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prosecutor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>code enforcement officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>adult or juvenile corrections officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corrections support staff member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>probation officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>member of the board of executive clemency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>law enforcement support staff member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>national guard member who is acting in support of a law enforcement agency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>person who is protected under an order of protection or injunction against harassment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>firefighter who is assigned to the Arizona counterterrorism center in the department of public safety</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>victim of domestic violence or stalking who is protected under an order of protection or injunction against harassment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ARS 39-124  Releasing information identifying an eligible person; violations; classification; definitions

A. Any person who is employed by a state or local government entity and who:
   • knowingly releases the home address or home telephone number of an eligible person
   • with the intent to hinder an investigation,
   • cause physical injury to an eligible person or the eligible person's immediate family or
   • cause damage to the property of an eligible person or the eligible person's immediate family
   • is Guilty of a Class 6 Felony.

B. Any person who is employed by a state or local government entity
   • knowingly releases a photograph of a peace officer (same conditions above)
   • is Guilty of a Class 6 Felony.
Nothing in this chapter requires the disclosure of public information that relates to the location of archaeological discoveries or places or objects that are included or may qualify for inclusion on the Arizona Register of Historic Places...

if the officer determines that the release of the information creates a reasonable risk of vandalism, theft or other damage to the archaeological discoveries or the places or objects that are included on or may qualify for inclusion on the register.

officer may consult with the director of the Arizona State Museum or the State Historic Preservation officer.
Nothing in this chapter requires the disclosure of a risk assessment that is performed by or on behalf of a federal agency to evaluate critical energy, water or telecommunications infrastructure to determine its vulnerability to sabotage or attack.
Free Police Reports for Victims

ARS 39-127 Free copies of police reports and transcripts for crime victims; definitions

- A victim of a criminal offense or an immediate family member of the victim if the victim is killed or incapacitated
- has the right to receive one copy of the police report from the investigating law enforcement agency at no charge and, on request of the victim,
- the court or the clerk of the court shall provide, at no charge, the minute entry or portion of the record of any proceeding in the case
- that is reasonably necessary for the purpose of pursuing a claimed victim's right.
ARS 39-128  Disciplinary records of public officers and employees; disclosure; exceptions

A. A public body shall maintain all records that are reasonably necessary or appropriate to maintain an accurate knowledge of disciplinary actions, including the employee responses to all disciplinary actions, involving public officers or employees of the public body.

- The records shall be open to inspection and copying pursuant to this article, unless inspection or disclosure of the records or information in the records is contrary to law.

B. This section does not:

1. Require disclosure of the home address, home telephone number or photograph of any person who is an “eligible person”.

2. Limit the duty of a public body or officer to make public records open to inspection and copying pursuant to this article.
The following slides are not specifically related to Title 39, but are general principles that apply to Public Records Requests.

- The first two relate to Denying Public Records Requests
- The next two slides relate to Confidential Records and Redaction of records
- The next couple of slides related to case law and Public Records Requests
Three Reasons to Deny Access

1. Confidentiality
2. Privacy
3. Best Interests of the State
#1 – Confidentiality

- Made confidential by law, not ad hoc decision by agency
- Made confidential by statute, rule or a recognized privilege:
  - Constitution
  - Statute (State or Federal)
  - State Agency Rule (force and effect of law)
  - Court Rule (e.g., Arizona Supreme Court Rule 123)
#2 – Privacy

- Constitutionally-protected right –
  - Arizona Constitution, article II, 8
  - Standard:
    - Disclosure would invade privacy
    - **AND**
    - That would outweigh the public’s right to know.

**Public embarrassment does not preclude disclosure**
#3 – Best Interests of the State

Standard:

- The burden is on the government to show that the public body would be seriously impaired in the performance of its duties.
- Must balance the adverse impact on the government against the public right to be informed about operations of the government.

Note: Fear of litigation does not preclude disclosure.
Two Balancing Tests Applied on Case by Case Basis:

- Right to privacy
  - Disclosure would invade privacy and that interest outweighs the public’s right to know

- Best interests of the State
  - Seriously impair performance of duties
6.4.1 Records Confidential by Statute.

- There are **over 300 Arizona statutes** that address the confidentiality of records.

- A comprehensive list of the Arizona statutes that may require that all or a portion of governmental records be protected from public disclosure is included at the end of this chapter. Appendix 6.1.


- **Appendix 6.1 Records Made Confidential/Non-Disclosable by Arizona Statute**
  (In Order by Title/Statute)
  - Arizona rules may also limit disclosure of certain information.
  - In addition, federal law may require confidential treatment of certain information. See, e.g., 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(c)(ii), (viii)(I) (**prohibiting disclosure of social security numbers** to unauthorized persons).

- Public officials and employees should review the confidentiality provisions that affect their areas of responsibility to avoid disclosure of confidential information.
6.5.3 Duty to Redact

- When confidential and public information are commingled in a single document, a copy of the document may be made available for public inspection with the confidential material excised.

- If confidential material has been attached to an otherwise disclosable document, the material so attached may simply be removed.
On October 29, 2009, in *Lake v. City of Phoenix* (CV-09-0036-PR), the Arizona Supreme Court held that “when a public entity maintains a public record in an electronic format, the electronic version of the record, including any embedded metadata is subject to disclosure under Arizona’s public records law.”

- **There are four (4) important effects** from the *Lake* decision [*David Lake v. City of Phoenix*, 222 Ariz. 547, 218 P.3d 1004 (2009)]

- **Metadata is a public record.** If records are retained in an electronic format, and the public requests those records, then the public has a right to receive those records in the electronic format, including all metadata associated with the records being requested.

- **Police reports stored in a municipality's records management system that are linked to restricted databases of State and National criminal justice agencies are subject to disclosure as public records.**

- **Just because an employee leaves the public body does not remove the Records Management and public records requirements for email records of that former employee.** Responsive e-mails of a former city employee in the possession of the city at the time of the request were subject to disclosure as public records.

- **Working Documents are records.** Unfinished police reports are subject to disclosure as public records absent any argument that the records should have been protected from production because of concerns regarding confidentiality, privacy, or the best interests of the state.
Court of Appeals held that ARS 39-121.01(D)(1) does not require submission of separate requests for successive records

- When records are:
  - Clearly articulated (easily defined)
  - Part of defined category (identifiable category)
  - Created over time (regularly generated)
  - Example: press releases, minutes
Common Pitfalls of Public Records Requests

10. Not knowing what is a public record.
9. Failure to have, update, or follow record management system.
8. Inappropriately handling requests.
7. Failing to promptly furnish public records.
6. Not knowing the exceptions.
5. Making promises you cannot keep.
4. Failure to recognize e-mail issues.
3. Charging unauthorized fees.
2. Not understanding commercial purpose.
1. Records dump.
Public Records Laws – Detailed

Accessing Arizona Public Records

Public Records Requests should be made directly to the agency where the records reside. Title 39 of the Arizona Revised Statutes covers public records requests, and requires that public records and other matters in the custody of any officer shall be open to inspection by any person at all times during business hours.

For questions or concerns regarding public records requests, contact the Arizona Ombudsman Citizen’s Aide.

Personal Records

Personal records are covered by statute. Many personal records are under restricted access. Birth certificates are closed for 75 years, death certificates are closed for 50 years. Adoption records, probate records involving juveniles, school student records and Arizona State Hospital records of patients are closed.

Court Records

County Superior Court records that are 50 years and older are required under statute to be transferred to the State Archives. With the exception of some records involving adoptions or juveniles, these court records are open to the public.

Business Records

The state archives does not have an extensive collection of business records. The state archives has some Arizona Corporation Commission records and some records from the Arizona Secretary of State’s office that include business filings.

Accessing Records With Azpublicinfo.Com

The Arizona Republic and azcentral.com have created the website azpublicinfo.com to make it as simple as possible for citizens to request public records from government agencies. The website identifies the types of public information maintained by Arizona’s governmental jurisdictions, helps users identify records they may be seeking, and allows users to send public-record requests directly to the agencies:

azpublicinfo.com
Got Questions?

Any Questions?
Helpful Contacts

Records Management Center (LAPR):
http://www.azlibrary.gov/records/
Phone: 602-926-3815
records@azlibrary.gov

Dr. Ted Hale:
thale@azlibrary.gov
Phone: 602-926-3736

Kurtis Chandler
kchandler@azlibrary.gov
Phone: 602-926-3817

Elizabeth Adigwu
eadigwu@azlibrary.gov
Phone: 602-926-3819

Richard Carroll
rcarroll@azlibrary.gov
Phone: 602-926-3818

State Ombudsman’s Office
http://www.azleg.gov/ombudsman/default.asp

State Attorney General – Public Records Publication
https://www.azag.gov/sites/default/files/sites/all/docs/agency-handbook/ch06.pdf

ARMA International:
http://www.arma.org/

AIIM – Global Community of Information Professionals
http://www.aiim.org/

Institute of Certified Records Managers (ICRM):
http://www.icrm.org/

National Archives and Records Management (NARA):
http://www.archives.gov/records-mgmt/

National Association of Government Archivists and Records Administrators (NAGARA):
http://www.nagara.org/index.cfm